

Authors

Ricardo Godoy
Brandeis University

Dean Karlan
Northwestern University

Jonathan Zinman
Dartmouth College

Randomization for Causality, Ethnography for Mechanisms: Illiquid Savings for Liquor in an Autarkic Society

Ricardo Godoy, Dean Karlan, and Jonathan Zinman*
December 2021

Abstract

What should researchers do when confronted with surprising results? Financial access innovations usually leave “temptation” spending unaffected or reduced. However, we found that promotion of savings lockboxes in a largely autarkic society increased alcohol consumption and blood pressure, despite no one reporting intentions to save for alcohol. To probe mechanisms that could explain this pattern, we then used ethnographic methods, including direct observations of drinking (“scans”) and debriefing interviews to discuss the earlier trial results. We learn that sponsoring drinks confers prestige, but the stigma attached to drinking by outsiders likely discouraged reporting intentions to save for it.

JEL classification: D12, I12, O15

Keywords: Mixed methods, randomized evaluation, native Amazonians, Tsimane’, temptation, commitment savings

* Ricardo Godoy: rgodoy@brandeis.edu; Brandeis University, Heller School for Social Policy and Management, Waltham, MA 02453; Dean Karlan: karlan@northwestern.edu; Northwestern University, Innovations for Poverty Action, M.I.T. James Poverty Action Lab, NBER, Northwestern University, Kellogg School of Management, 2211 Campus Drive, Northwestern University, Evanston, IL 60208, USA; Jonathan Zinman: jzinman@dartmouth.edu; Dartmouth College, Innovations for Poverty Action, M.I.T. James Poverty Action Lab, NBER, Dartmouth College, Department of Economics, Hanover, New Hampshire 03755, USA. Research was funded by a grant from the World Bank Research Committee (RF-P12303-RESE-BBRSB) and the Bill and Melinda Gates Foundation. We thank Harry Patrinos (World Bank) for his support and patience, Dylan Ramdhani and Innovations for Poverty Action for managing fieldwork, Tomás Huancas and Esther Goode of CBIDS and CBIDS surveyors and translators for exceptional fieldwork, and Mike Feng, Zachary Goff, Michael Immanuel, Javier Madrazo, Diego Santa Maria, Glynnis Sturtz, and Jonathan Hy Vaynes for excellent research assistance. Institutional Review Board approval from Yale University (0905003895), Northwestern University (STU00203895) and Innovations for Poverty Action (SP201.2010.01.06). This trial is registered in the American Economic Association’s registry for randomized controlled trials (ID: AEARCTR-0009670).

Randomization for Causality, Ethnography for Mechanisms: Illiquid Savings for Liquor in an Autarkic Society

January 24, 2022