

## Authors

Christopher Blattman  
The University of Chicago

Gustavo Duncan  
EAFIT University

Benjamin Lessing  
The University of Chicago

Santiago Tobón  
Universidad EAFIT

# Civilian alternatives to policing: Evidence from Medellín's community problem-solving intervention *Operación Convivencia*\*

Christopher Blattman   Gustavo Duncan   Benjamin Lessing  
Santiago Tobón<sup>†</sup>

May 20, 2023

## Abstract

Cities are searching for unarmed approaches to disorder and crime. Colombia is a leader here. Police are a national institution, and mayors have limited control over police staffing and operations. Thus, many cities have developed large civilian apparatuses for dispute resolution, family problems, and street disorder—an approach commonly called *convivencia* (coexistence). We worked with Medellín's municipal government to identify 80 typical neighborhoods and experimentally evaluate this approach. In half, the city intensified their civilian apparatus for 20 months, assigning full-time *alcaldes* to help communities organize to improve public order, foster communication with the government, and connect residents to dispute resolution and family/social services. A randomized task force ensured city agencies fulfilled these roles. This represented a 60-fold increase in street-level presence, plus increased city agency attention. To our surprise, *Operación Convivencia* had no average treatment effect on reported governance, legitimacy, or crime. Anticipating that impacts could diverge by neighborhood, however, we propensity-heterogeneity analyses by initial state presence. This proved revealing. In neighborhoods where the state began weak, the task force and city agencies worked speedily, and opinions of governance fell. In neighborhoods where the state began relatively strong, the task force and task force delivered, and there are indications this raised state legitimacy and reduced crime and emergency calls. The divergent results suggest the importance of existing state capacity, plus the dangers of over-promising and under-delivering. This may be especially important in Latin America, where cities like Medellín compete with gangs for local problem-solving and legitimacy.

**JEL codes:** R01, K42, O17, N46, C93

**Keywords:** Local government, public safety, governance, policing, crime, state building, urban policy, public services, security, gangs, field experiment, Colombia

\*For comments we thank Thomas Ahl, Cristian Baudino, Eli Bernaca, Jessica Drake, Sarah Baker, Mar Kapustin, Mariana Rangel, Raul Sanchez de la Sierra, Jacob Shapiro, Carlos Schmidt-Pedraza, Paolo Pinotti, Maria Mercedes Strickland, Juan P. Vargas, and participants at several seminars and conferences. Innovations for Poverty Action coordinated all research activities. For research assistance we thank Valeria Abril, Bruno Arango, David Cosen, Peter Dufschneck, Felipe Fajardo, Sebastián Hernández, Sofía Jaramillo, Juan F. Martínez, Juan Pablo Mesa-Mejía, Angie Montoya, Bikem Mustafa, José Miguel Pascual, Andrés Pineda, Andrés Rodríguez-Celis, Rachel Rossmore, Nelson María-Correa, Martín Varguez-Ariza and Mónica Viqueira. We thank the Secretariat of Security of Medellín for their cooperation, especially the former Secretary of Security Andrés Tobón, as well as Luis Ochoa and Ana María Ospina. For financial support, we thank the Centro de Estudios sobre Seguridad y Derechos (CESD) of Universidad de los Andes, the Peace and Recovery Program (PRP) at Innovations for Poverty Action (IPA), the PEAN/TORQUEA foundation, The National Science Foundation (NSF), the UK Foreign, Commonwealth & Development Office through the Crime and Violence Initiative at JPRU, and the Economic Development and Institutions Programme (EDI) funded with UK aid from the UK Government, working in partnership with Oxford Policy Management Limited, University of Sussex, Peter Hall of Economics and Arts & in Division Economics.

<sup>†</sup>Correspondence: University of Chicago, 5308R, blattman@chicago.edu; Duncan: duncan@chicago.edu; Lessing: lessing@chicago.edu; Tobón: tobonsantiago@chicago.edu; [blattman@chicago.edu](mailto:blattman@chicago.edu)

Civilian alternatives to policing: Evidence from Medellín's community problem-solving Intervention Operación Convivencia

# Civilian alternatives to policing: Evidence from Medellín's community problem-solving Intervention Operación Convivencia

Cities are searching for unarmed approaches to disorder and crime. Colombia is a leader

here. Police are a national institution, and mayors have limited control over police staffing and operations. Thus, many cities have developed large civilian apparatuses for dispute resolution, family problems, and street disorder—an approach commonly called *convivencia* (coexistence). Researchers worked with Medellín’s municipal government to identify 80 typical neighborhoods and experimentally evaluate this approach. In half, the city intensified their civilian apparatus for 20 months, assigning full-time liaisons to help communities organize to improve public order, foster communication with the government, and connect residents to dispute resolution and family/social services. A centralized task force ensured city agencies fulfilled these roles. This represented a 60-fold increase in street-level presence, plus increased city agency attention. To the researchers' surprise, *Operación Convivencia* had no average treatment effect on reported governance, legitimacy, or crime. Anticipating that impacts could diverge by neighborhood, however, the researchers prespecified heterogeneity analyses by initial state presence. This proved revealing. In neighborhoods where the state began weak, the task force and city agencies worked sporadically, and opinions of governance fell. In neighborhoods where the state began relatively strong, the liaisons and task force delivered, and there are indications this raised state legitimacy and reduced crime and emergency calls. The divergent results suggest the importance of existing state capacity, plus the dangers of over-promising and under-delivering. This may be especially important in Latin America, where cities like Medellín compete with gangs for local problem-solving and legitimacy.

May 24, 2023